

**Historical Buildings and Sites Commission
MEETING MINUTES
September 9, 2021
5:15 pm Council Chambers**

COMMISSIONERS:

Ward Warren (Chair)
Arden McConnell (Vice Chair)
Virginia Ford
Shirley Holzinger
Bill Richardson
Nathan Miller
Sandra Crowder - Absent

STAFF/LIAISON MEMBERS:

Bradley Clark – Director Community Development
Donna Rupp – Associate Planner

STAFF/LIAISON MEMBERS:

Joel King

GUESTS:

Andre Edson, Edson Café
Amanda Flynn, Ausland Group

1. **Roll Call** – Chair Warren called the meeting to order at 5:28 pm.
2. **Introductions**
3. **Public Comment:** None.
4. **Approval of August 12, 2021 Minutes:**

Amend minutes to reflect that HBSC will be included on future discussions and planning for the Welcome Center remodel, under item #5.
Also amend minutes to reflect that HBSC preferred design #4 for the Welcome Center remodel, which included wood siding and brick on the lower portion of the building.

MOTION

**Vice Chair McConnell moved, and Chair Warren seconded the motion to approve the August 12, 2021 minutes as amended. The vote resulted as follows: “AYES”: Chair Warren, Vice Chair McConnell, Commissioners Ford, Miller, Richardson and Holzinger.
“NAYS”: None. Abstain: None. Absent: Commissioner Crowder.
The motion passed.**

5. **Action Items:**

- a. **Continued public hearing: 303-00111-21 Edson – conversion of garage/carriage house to café.**

Continued hearing to review the building elevations of the proposed café. The submittals for the first hearing did not include window and door details. HBSC had also requested confirmation on trim color for stairs. Applicant submitted color chips for the trim and paint color, as well detailed renderings of the doors and windows. After discussion, the HBSC recommended that the applicant consider dividers on all windows to provide a more cohesive look.

MOTION

**Chair Warren moved, and Vice Chair McConnell seconded the motion to approve the application for the Edson Café as proposed, with the recommendation that the applicant consider adding dividers to the windows where appropriate. The vote resulted as follows: “AYES”: Chair Warren, Vice Chair McConnell, Commissioners Ford, Miller, Richardson and Holzinger. “NAYS”: None. Abstain: None. Absent: Commissioner Crowder.
The motion passed.**

b. Riverside Park Local Landmark application 303-00114-21: Findings of Fact.

MOTION

Chair Warren moved, and Commissioner Richardson seconded the motion to approve the Riverside Park Local Landmark Application Findings of Fact. The vote resulted as follows: “AYES”: Chair Warren, Vice Chair McConnell, Commissioners Ford, Miller, Richardson and Holzinger. “NAYS”: None. Abstain: None. Absent: Commissioner Crowder. The motion passed.

c. Newman Methodist Church ADA Ramps.

Guest Amanda Flynn of the Ausland Group discussed the project with the HBSC. The church has been working on creating ADA ramps since 2019 with raising funds for design and construction. Plans were submitted to the Planning Department for review. Planning suggested that HBSC be given a chance to offer guidance on the project (not a formal review).

Amanda mentioned that the ramps will be attaching to a small addition that was constructed in 1980 and will not alter the historic exterior of the church. HBSC suggested adding color to the poured concrete or texture to make it more attractive. They also suggested that the materials and design of the handrails be considered for aesthetics. HBSC thanked Amanda and staff for the opportunity to review the project.

6. Matters from Commission Members and Staff:

a. Brochure and Welcome Letter

The brochure in the Community Development lobby is one with a date of 6/8/2020 and needs to be replaced with the newer version. Staff in the front office will be advised to make the change.

Request to update brochure:

Remove “opt out” language below map;

Remove numbers on buildings on the map;

Add “Murals require review” to brochure; and

When welcome letter is updated, take some of the language from it, condense it, and add to brochure for future revision.

The Welcome Letter the HBSC was looking for was likely sent in 2015-2016. Commissioners and staff will look for a more recent letter than the 2008 one included in the packet, which is not the version they were requesting.

b. Local Landmark Addressing issue

Brad provided an updated address list for the properties Commissioner McConnell had inquired about. Chair Warren said that the Local Historic Landmark List he found on the website was not updated. Staff requested a link to where he found the outdated list and agreed to send the list that is published in Article 13.

c. Conservation District update

It was rescheduled for Council review and is now on the Council workshop agenda for September 27.

d. Review of National Register properties by HBSC – update by Brad.

Clarification that the HBSC is the review body for alterations for structures on the Register. Brad researched properties that had some vacant land and where new development is proposed on the vacant land. Only alterations to existing structures require review. That is how our code is written. Alterations to that may have to be proposed.

Other matters:

- Content for CLG Monday on NPS Facebook page: They requested photos and a short write up to post on the National Park Service Facebook page to introduce new CLG communities. Commissioners suggested other photos than the ones provided by staff. Commissioner Miller offered to create the montage with new photos. Several Commissioners will work on the write up for review.
- Request was made for copy of “consent form” for Local Landmark applications to be emailed to Commissioners. (Note: It is the Planning Application form.)
- A pre-application conference was held for new development on G Street in the old “Goodness Gracious” site and to build across the patio next to it. Applicant was provided with details on the requirements for meeting historic design standards. Staff does not know when they will submit the actual Site Plan Review application – possibly in October or November.
- The November meeting will need to be moved to November 18 because Veterans Day falls on the regularly scheduled second Thursday. All Commissioners can make that date except Commissioner Miller. HBSC agreed to the change.
- Councilor King commented that he’d “like to honor the commission members and the staff for working well together. And I think that together, we’re making a difference in what the future Grants Pass is going to be like. And the history of Grants Pass is going to be maintained and enhanced and it’s just a wonderful effort. Thank you.”

7. Future Agenda Building for Next Meeting:

- a. Conservation District Design Overlay
- b. Local Landmarks list update
- c. Review Welcome letter and brochure

8. Adjourn: 7:20 pm

Next Meeting: October 14, 2021

Summary minutes prepared by Donna Rupp, Associate Planner, Grants Pass Community Development.

**CITY OF GRANTS PASS
COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT**

**EDSON CAFÉ, 139 SW I STREET
ADDITION TO EXISTING STRUCTURES IN HISTORIC DISTRICT
FINDINGS OF FACT**

Procedure Type:	Type III: Historical Buildings and Sites Commission (HBSC)
Project Number:	303-00111-21
Project Type:	HBSC Exterior Structure Addition Review
Owner:	Linda Edson
Representative:	Andre Edson
Property Address:	139 SW I Street
Map and Tax Lot:	36-05-18-DA TL 9600
Zoning:	Central Business District - CBD (City)
Planner Assigned:	Donna Rupp
Application Received:	April 30, 2021
Application Complete:	May 6, 2021
Date of Staff Report:	June 3, 2021
Date of Hearings:	June 10, 2021 & September 9, 2021
Date of Findings of Fact:	October 14, 2021
120 Day Deadline	September 3, 2021 (Applicant requested extension)

Note: ***Bold Italic Text*** indicates text added by the Commission that was not contained in the staff report. ~~Strikeout Text~~ indicates deletions made by the Commission.

I. PROPOSAL:

The request is for review of an expansion of an existing garage and shed, and conversion to a café with a new commercial kitchen and dining area located at 139 SW I Street. This review is to determine that the new structure’s exterior elevations are compatible with the Historic District criteria for exterior elevations only. The major site plan (Application #201-00374-21) was reviewed under a separate Director’s Decision, Type I-C, and approved on June 4, 2021 with conditions, including conditions based on the outcome of this HBSC hearing.

II. AUTHORITY AND CRITERIA:

Sections 2.050, 7.063 and 13.450 of the *Grants Pass Development Code* (GPDC) authorizes the Historical Buildings and Sites Commission to review alteration of structures within the Grants Pass Downtown Historic District as a Type III procedure. In accordance with Section 13.454 of the GPDC, the Historical Buildings and Sites Commission shall be empowered to set the conditions of approval based on compliance with the criteria found in Section 13.452. The decision must be based upon the criteria contained in Section 13.452 of the GPDC.

III. APPEAL PROCEDURE:

Section 10.050, City of Grants Pass Development Code, provides for an appeal of the Historical Buildings and Sites Commission’s decision to the City Council. Based on Section 10.051, an appeal must be filed within twelve (12) calendar days from the date the written decision is mailed.

IV. PROCEDURE:

- A.** An application for a HBSC review of an expansion of an existing garage and shed, and conversion to a café in the Historic District was submitted on April 30, 2021 and deemed complete on May 6, 2021. The application was process in accordance with Section 7.063 of the GPDC.
- B.** Public notice of the June 10, 2021 HBSC hearing was mailed on May 19, 2021 in accordance with Section 7.063 of the GPDC.
- C.** A public hearing was held on June 10, 2021 and continued to September 9, 2021, per the applicant’s request.
- D.** The HBSC voted to approve proposal with a vote of 6-0-0.

V. SUMMARY OF EVIDENCE:

- A.** The basic facts and criteria regarding this application are contained in the original staff report for 303-00111-21 presented at the June 10, 2021 hearing. This report is attached as Exhibit “A” and incorporated herein.
- B.** The minutes of the public hearings held by the HBSC on June 10, 2021 and September 9, 2021, attached as Exhibit “B”, summarize the oral testimony presented and are incorporated herein.
- C.** The PowerPoint presentation given by staff on June 10, 2021 is attached as Exhibit “C” and incorporated herein.
- D.** Additional information on the windows, doors and paint colors requested by the HBSC at the June 10, 2021 hearing and presented at the September 9, 2021 hearing is attached as Exhibit “D” and incorporated herein.

VI. FINDINGS OF FACT:

The Historical Buildings and Sites Commission found that based upon the testimony given at the public hearings and the staff reports, the proposal meets the criteria in Sections 13.452 of the GPDC based on the reasons stated in the findings included below.

VII. GENERAL FINDINGS OF FACT:

A. Characteristics of the Property:

- 1. Land Use Designation:
Comprehensive Plan: Central Business District (CBD)

- | | | |
|----|----------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | Zone District: | CBD (City) |
| | Special Purpose District: | Downtown Historic District |
| 2. | Size: | 0.23 acres |
| 3. | Frontage: | SW I Street, SW 5 th Street |
| 4. | Access: | SW I Street, SW 5 th Street and Alley |
| 5. | Existing Public Utilities: | Water: 12-inch main in SW 5 th Street
6-inch main in SW I Street |
| | | Sewer: 12-inch main in SW 5 th Street |
| | | Storm: 12-inch main in SW 5 th Street
Curb/Gutter in SW I and 5 th Streets |
| 6. | Topography: | Flat |
| 7. | Existing Land Use: | Historic house built circa 1908 with gardens and garage. |
| 8. | Surrounding Land Uses: | North – office space; East – banking and parking; South – parking; West – office. All in CBD and Historic District zones. |

B. Discussion

The request is for review of an expansion of an existing garage and shed, and conversion to a café with a new commercial kitchen and dining area. This review is to determine that the new structure's exterior elevations are compatible with the Historic District criteria for exterior of historic structures only.

The structure is an existing garage on the property of the Herbert and Katherine Smith House, built circa 1908. The main house is listed as a local historic and national register resource. It is one of the three brick residences remaining in the original town plat of Grants Pass.

Restaurant use is allowed in both the Central Business and Historic Districts. The accessory building that is being proposed for the new café and kitchen is located adjacent to the alley that runs parallel to SW I Street, between SW 5th and 6th Streets.

A Major Site Plan Review was submitted on April 30 and deemed complete on May 6, 2021 to convert the garage into a café. That application (#201-00374-21) was reviewed separately under a Director's Decision, Type I-C, and approved on June 4, 2021 with conditions, including conditions based on the outcome of the HBSC hearing. The staff report addresses all other major site plan criteria per Section 19.052 of the Development Code.

The applicant supplied a narrative, plans, and sample photos that reflect the style of the proposed new addition in their application.

VIII. CONFORMANCE WITH CRITERIA:

- A. In determining the appropriateness of the new structures as proposed in the application for a building permit, the Commission shall consider the following:**

Criterion 1: Complies with the applicable development standards of this section. The Elements of Compatibility (Section 13.453) are used to address this Criterion. They include the following:

(1) Materials. Variety of materials adds visual interest, supports compatibility, and minimizes the impact of mass.

(a) Brick and Stucco are the recommended materials for building faces, depending on the age and design of the building.

(b) Exposed brick is desirable when possible, particularly on buildings of the 1890-1920 period.

(c) Materials Requiring HBSC Review:

(i) River rock, or other round rock surfaces.

(ii) Corrugated metal panels, similar metal products, corrugate fiberglass panels, or any other material that requires corrugation, seams or similar manipulation of the exterior surface to prevent deflection of the surface.

(2) Roofs.

(a) Exclusions. Re-roofing any historic structure, ... is excluded from review under this section.

(b) Pre-Approved Materials for Residences. The following roofing materials are pre-approved for use in the Historic District:

(i) Wood Shakes.

(ii) Wood Shingles.

(iii) Fiberglass Composition (Asphalt) Shingle:

(A) 3-Tab.

(B) Architectural Grade Fiberglass Composition (Asphalt).

(C) Asphalt Shake/Multi-Layer Asphalt.

(3) Additions and/or New Construction. New additions, exterior alterations or related new construction shall be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property.

(4) Colors. Paint and roof color represent highly visible elements of a building that can either greatly enhance, or greatly detract, from historic character.

(a) Exterior colors shall be selected from commercially available historical color palettes.

(b) The application of up to five individual colors per building, up to two for the predominate walls and up to three for trim is allowed.

HBSC Response: Satisfied with conditions.

Materials: The architecturally designed exterior elevations show a variety of building materials, including brick as the primary siding material. Brick is an approved material for building faces. Brick shown on the elevations match historic siding found on the main Smith house on this property. Applicant has provided photos of the existing exterior of the garage and house and intends to match the new construction to the existing.

Roof: Will be approved fiberglass composition shingles which will match those on the main house.

New Construction: The proposed plans show a level of detail reflecting acceptable features, size, scale and proportions to blend with the Downtown Historic District.

The HBSC recommends that the windows include grids whenever possible to provide consistent design. ~~However, window and door details were not included in the elevations. As a condition of approval, applicant must provide cut sheets or architectural renderings of the windows and doors which will be used on the new construction and remodel.~~

Colors: Paint colors are indicated to match those used on the main house. ***The HBSC approves the paint colors submitted at the September 9, 2021 hearing.*** ~~As a condition of approval, applicant will bring commercially available paint color samples from a historic palette to the Community Development Department for approval prior to commencing painting.~~

Criterion 2: The purpose of Section 13.411 (Historic Resources: Districts and Landmarks), which include:

1. Effect and accomplish the protection, enhancement and perpetuation of such improvements and of districts which represent or reflect elements of the City's and County's cultural, social, economic, political and architectural history;
2. Safe guard the City's and County's historic, aesthetic and cultural heritage as embodied and reflected in such improvement districts;
3. Complement any National Register Historic Districts designated in the City;
4. Stabilize and improve property values in such districts;
5. Foster civic pride in the beauty of historic buildings structures sites and signage and noble accomplishment of the past; and
6. Protect and enhance the City's attractions to tourists and visitors and the support and stimulus to business and industry thereby provided.

HBSC Response: Satisfied.

1. The applicant has indicated in their application that the new construction honors Grants Pass' history by drawing on same style as the existing main house on the property.
2. The development safe guard's local history by keeping the outside walls of the existing garage on two sides, as feasible based on the building plans.
3. The G Street National Register Historic District is three blocks away from the project and the project will have no immediate impact on the District, other than providing a new eating establishment within a walkable distance.
4. The project will stabilize and improve property values by building a desirable destination café within the Historic District.

5. The project will foster civic pride by representing the beauty of historic buildings, structures, sites and signage and noble accomplishment of the past. Special care is being taken to incorporate historically accurate designs.

6. The project will protect and enhance the City's attractions to tourists and visitors and support business and industry by adding a new dining establishment in the Historic District. Locals and tourists who are interested in history, will be able to view the Smith House from beyond the sidewalk.

Criterion 3: The general compatibility of the signage, exterior design, arrangement, proportion, detail, scale, color, texture and materials proposed to be used in the construction of the new building or structure.

HBSC Response: Satisfied with conditions.

Signage is not proposed with this application. Any new exterior signs in the Historic District must be submitted for separate review by HBSC.

The proposed structure meets exterior design, arrangement, detail, scale, texture and materials elements as reviewed under Criterion 1 and the Elements of Compatibility. ~~The elements not included for review with the elevations are the windows and doors. That condition is addressed in Criterion 1 above.~~

Criterion 4: The effect of the proposed new structure on the character of the district;

HBSC Response: Satisfied.

The proposed design of the garage and shed reflects the historical architecture of the main house. It appears to blend in with the surrounding properties within the Historic District. ~~The Commission will need to assess the effect of the proposed structure on the neighborhood.~~

Criterion 5: The economic effect of the new structure on the historic value of the district.

HBSC Response: Satisfied.

The economic effect on the historic value of the District is expected to be positive based on the design of the proposed structure complimenting the main house and other brick structures in the District. By designing the building to reflect past architectural styles rather than modern design, this proposal honors the City's past and provides another attraction to draw people into the Historic District and will enhance the business and tourism environment.

Criterion 6: Complies with required applicable state and federal design guidelines.

HBSC Response: Satisfied.

Future building permits will undergo state and local building code review for life safety issues. Historic design guidelines from state and federal sources are not applicable to new structures in the City of Grants Pass.

IX. DECISION AND SUMMARY:

The Historical Buildings and Sites Commission **APPROVED** the new exterior elevations for a new café in the Historic District with the following conditions. The vote for approval was 6-0-0, with Commissioners Warren, McConnell, Miller, Ford, Richardson and Holzinger voting in favor. Commissioner Crowder was absent.

A. The following shall be accomplished within eighteen months of the date this report is signed and prior to issuance of a Development Permit. Otherwise, the approval shall expire. Extension of the Development Permit is permitted pursuant to Section 3.093(2) of the Development Code.

- ~~1. Submit revised building elevations indicating the type and style of proposed windows and doors that meet historical designs.~~
2. A new address for the business must be obtained prior to submitting building plans.

B. The information provided below is provided for your information only. The following must be accomplished prior to issuance of a Building Permit:

1. Submit construction documents to the Building Division for their review and approval to determine compliance with all Building, Fire and Life Safety, and adopted Oregon Structural Specialty Code requirements. Building plans shall be consistent with the approved site plan. The plans must be prepared by an Oregon-licensed design professional.
 - a. Building plans shall be consistent with approved site plan;
 - b. Buildings must comply with all applicable building and fire codes;
 - i. Structures exceeding the required fire department access shall provide an approved fire suppression system.

C. The following must be accomplished prior to issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy:

1. Development must occur according to the approved site plan, landscape plan, and construction drawings including the items listed below. The developer must contact the Community Development Department and arrange for a final inspection prior to occupancy to ensure compliance.
2. Bring commercially available paint color samples from a historic palette to the Community Development Department for approval prior to painting.

X. FINDINGS APPROVED BY THE HISTORICAL BUILDINGS AND SITES COMMISSION, this 14th day of October, 2021.

Ward Warren, HBSC Chair

Dear Property Owner / Business Owner:

You may have just applied for a city permit that involves a HBSC review. What does this mean and who is the HBSC?

In 2016 our city created the Grants Pass Historic District that your property is located within. Since that time, properties in the historic district have received special promotions, incentives, and protections that typically are not available to properties outside of the district. Visitors are highly attracted to historic districts, which is part of why our historic district is the hub of our city, and the first place visitors stop to shop, eat and explore.

Signs and building permits that involve new or modified exteriors are reviewed by the Historic Building and Sites Commission (HBSC). The HBSC is made up of seven appointed volunteers that strive to be a helpful resource for building and business owners in our downtown area. Many on the Commission are familiar with historic architecture and can be a resource to provide guidance on historic preservation and construction. Several of the Commissioners are also business and property owners in the historic district.

When reviewing building permits for exterior modifications or new construction, the HBSC is there to assist with the process, and to help with direction on how to maintain or modify a historic building while ensuring that any new construction fits well within the historic district.

While this is one small additional step in the permit process for you, this process ensures that your neighboring properties do not damage the integrity of the neighborhood and your neighborhood continues to remain attractive and historic - thereby continuing to flourish as our historic district has for decades.

Bringing a project to a review commission can sometimes feel challenging; however, the HBSC hopes you are excited to tell them about your project as they are to hear about it. A professional presentation is of course welcome; however, it is not expected or required. The HBSC just wants to see a visual representation of what your project is going to look like when finished.

The city staff are also quite familiar with the guidelines so they can help you understand what the HBSC is going to be looking at and if it meets our local historic criteria, prior to your meeting with the HBSC.

We look forward to hearing about your project,

Sincerely,

The Historic Buildings & Sites Commission

6.d. Photo collage for NPS CLG Facebook Page

